

Vehicle Maintenance Program

Goal: To contract for vehicle maintenance that will both save money and provide our emergency response departments a vendor that will meet the needs of their departments.

Objective: To evaluate the bids received to determine the most responsive bid.

Assumptions:

1. A total of three bids were received from Jerry Duncan Ford, Turpin Auto Repair and Eddie's Body Shop.
2. The bid was written to provide service groups, which describes a preventive maintenance schedule for emergency response vehicles in the Sheriff's Department and the Office of Emergency Services.
3. Also included in the Invitation to Bid was a request for pricing for towing services, road side assistance, storage and other general maintenance items that can be used by all county departments.
4. A tabulation of the pricing for each service group was prepared and the frequency of services was calculated to determine what the annual cost of the program would be for just the service groups.
5. A tabulation of the brake services was done.
6. In addition to looking at the pricing a comparison was done of the service items requested; the vendor's service hours, towing, road side assistance and storage.
7. An evaluation team consisting of Tim Phillips, Howie Rose, Dale Collins and Lynn Farnham reviewed the bids and made the decision to award the bid.

Analysis:

1. A meeting of the evaluation team was conducted on September 1, 2011 at 2:45 p.m. Those present were Tim Phillips, Scott Stout, Dale Collins and Lynn Farnham. Howie Rose was not available but he met with Lynn Farnham later in the afternoon and was given a recap of the earlier meeting.
2. The first step of the process was to evaluate service groups pricing. The pricing is a total of the Sheriff's Department's service groups and Emergency Service's service groups. The total annual cost for each vendor was Jerry Duncan Ford \$4,429.43; Turpin \$4,344.99 and Eddie's Body Shop ranged from \$5,872.57 to \$6,231.46. The reason for the range of pricing for Eddie's was due to the manner in which their bid was qualified having to do with age of the vehicles.
3. In looking at the service groups individually, Jerry Duncan Ford was the lowest bid for the Sheriff's service groups with a bid price of \$2,914.03; Turpin \$3,115.35 and Eddie's \$4,550.62 (using the lowest in the range of bids submitted by Eddie's).

4. There was confusion both from the way the bid was written and how the vendors submitted pricing for brake services. A tabulation of the pricing was done that is attached and it was determined based on the information available that Turpin was the low bid for brake services. Due to the poorly written specifications and the need for too much conjecture on the evaluator's part, this aspect of the bid did not weigh heavily on the decision to award.
5. After evaluating the aforementioned prices submitted, it was determined that there were two vendors to consider, Jerry Duncan Ford and Turpin Auto Repair since Eddie's Body Shop was higher on all bid items. Other prices submitted for these two vendors were evaluated, e.g. hourly rate, mark-up for parts, etc. In these areas, Turpin submitted the lowest prices. Jerry Duncan Ford's hourly rate is \$55 for standard, diagnostic and emergency repairs and Turpin is \$40 for standard and emergency repairs and \$20 for diagnostic work. Jerry Duncan Ford's mark-up is 15% over their cost and Turpin is 0%.
6. The service aspects of the bid were evaluated; towing, road side service, service hours, etc. Jerry Duncan Ford's business hours is Monday-Friday 7:30-5:00 and Turpin is available 24 hours/7 days per week; Jerry Duncan Ford offers no towing or roadside service and no storage and Turpin provides all services.

Conclusion:

1. As stated above based on just the pricing, it was determined that the most responsive bids were those submitted by Jerry Duncan Ford and Turpin Auto Repair.
2. Although there was some slight savings by splitting the service groups and allowing Jerry Duncan Ford to service the Sheriff's Department and Turpin to service the Emergency Service Departments, Tim Phillips recommended awarding the bid for the Sheriff's Department to Turpin Auto Repair also. The basis for his recommendation is the towing, roadside and storage services that are absolute necessities for the Sheriff's Department. The storage is the most critical of these services since they have nowhere to store their pool vehicles or their seized vehicles. Additionally, the Sheriff's Department has to have around the clock access to their pool cars and Turpin has provided this in the past.
3. For the Office of Emergency Services, the pricing for their service groups was lower with Turpin. Scott Stout (and Howie Rose concurred at the later meeting) also stated that the towing and roadside services are necessities for Emergency Services as is the 24 hour/7 day per week availability of service.
4. Based on the recommendations of Sheriff's Department and the Office of Emergency Services and my own evaluation of pricing and responsiveness to the Invitation to Bid, the bid should be awarded to Turpin Auto Repair. Additionally, Turpin Auto Repair is the existing contractor and has provided excellent service and has kept maintenance costs as low as possible.
5. As is the policy of the County Executive, vehicles that are under warranty should go to the dealer for any warranty items and for routine maintenance.